

UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS LAW JOURNAL

FALL 2006

VOLUME 4

NUMBER 2



Symposium

Catholicism and the Court: The Relevance of Faith Traditions to Jurisprudence

Keynote Address

Hon. Diarmuid O'Scannlain

Articles

Margaret O'Brien Steinfels
Michael J. Gerhardt
Sheldon Goldman
Edward A. Hartnett
Brian Z. Tamanaha

Sanford Levinson
Robert F. Cochran, Jr.
Scott C. Idleman
Hon. Joan B. Gottschall

Fides et Iustitia

UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS
LAW JOURNAL
Fides et Iustitia

FALL 2006

VOLUME 4

NUMBER 2

Editor-in-Chief
Christopher Nelson

Articles Editors
John Darda
Jacob Thorington

Managing Editor
Gloria R. Sonnen

Publications Editors
Graham Martin
Erika Toftness

Symposium Editor
Anna Petosky

Comments Editor
Christopher Duncan

Membership Editor
Alyssa Malecek Toft

Senior Editors
Jonathan Bakewicz
Matthew C. Berger
Joshua Brand
Caroline Bussey
Michael Cass
Kenneth Connelly, Jr.
Allison Frasier
Kathleen Klos
Lars Nelson
Laura Santos
Brooke Swenson

Associate Editors

Phil Ashfield
John Bisanz
Elizabeth Brenckman
Erin Collins
David Corbett
Abigail Dos Santos
Dave Dustrud
Christian Eichenlaub
Lisa Ellingson
Breia Euteneuer

Nicole Frank
Shannon Gherty
Laura Hammargren
Patrick Heaney
Max Kieley
Nathan Kumagai
Andrea Pavelka
Angela M. Streit
Theodore Waldeck
Jenny Weigel

Faculty Advisor
Professor Thomas C. Berg

Symposium Advisors
Professor Gregory C. Sisk
Professor Robert K. Vischer

Administrative Assistant
Jill Akervik

Publication Information: The *University of St. Thomas Law Journal* is published three times a year by law students at the University of St. Thomas School of Law in Minneapolis, Minnesota 55403-2015. It is printed by Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

Mission: The *University of St. Thomas Law Journal*, as a publication of a Catholic law school, is committed to encouraging ethical legal thinking through the publication of compelling legal scholarship dedicated to the discussion of morality and social justice, developing students' legal research and writing skills in an endeavor to produce accomplished servant leaders in the practice of law, and broadening the legal imagination to cultivate creative solutions to real world problems with a goal toward social change.

Subscription Information: Single issues are available for \$20.00. Subscriptions are \$50.00 per volume domestic, and \$100.00 per volume foreign. Unless the Journal receives notification of cancellation, subscriptions will be renewed annually.

Please send all change of address information, single issue and subscription inquiries, and cancellation notices to the address below.

Submission Guidelines: Unsolicited articles are considered for publication, but cannot be returned. All submissions should be double-spaced and conform to the *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation*. If selected for publication, all citations will be made to conform to the *The Bluebook*.

Please send all submissions to the address below. The Journal does accept submissions by e-mail.

Citation information: Please cite this issue as: 4 U. St. Thomas L.J. __ (2006). All citation generally conforms to the *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation*.

Copyright Information: Unless otherwise noted, any material to which the University of St. Thomas Law Journal holds the copyright may be reproduced, in whole or in part, by non-profit institutions for educational purposes, provided that (1) copies are distributed at or below cost; (2) the author and the *University of St. Thomas Law Journal* are identified, including the volume number, the page on which the article starts, and the year of publication; (3) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy; and (4) notice of use is given to the University of St. Thomas Law Journal.

Contact Information:

University of St. Thomas Law Journal
1000 LaSalle Avenue
MSL 225
Minneapolis, MN 55403

Telephone: (651) 962-4855 or (800) 328-6819, ext. 2-4855

Facsimile: (651) 962-4915

lawreview@stthomas.edu

<http://www.stthomas.edu/law/studentlife/journal/default.asp>

Copyright © 2007

University of St. Thomas Law Journal

All rights reserved except as specifically stated otherwise

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews

Printed in the United States of America

UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS
LAW JOURNAL
Fides et Iustitia

FALL 2006

VOLUME 4

NUMBER 2

**CATHOLICISM AND THE COURT:
THE RELEVANCE OF FAITH TRADITIONS TO JURISPRUDENCE**

KEYNOTE ADDRESS

- Must a Faithful Judge Be a Faithless Judge?** 157
Hon. Diarmuid O'Scannlain

ARTICLES

Panel: Why We Have a Catholic-Majority Court

- Catholicism and the Court: The Relevance of Faith Traditions in
Jurisprudence** 166
Margaret O'Brien Steinfels

- Why the Catholic Majority on the Supreme Court May Be
Unconstitutional** 173
Michael J. Gerhardt

- The Politics of Appointing Catholics to the Federal Courts** 193
Sheldon Goldman

Panel: Moral Conflicts in the Judge's Role

- Catholic Judges and Cooperation in Sin** 221
Edward A. Hartnett

- Good Casuistry and Bad Casuistry: Resolving the Dilemmas Faced by
Catholic Judges** 269
Brian Z. Tamanaha

Panel: The Role of Faith in Judging

- Is It Possible to Have a Serious Discussion About Religious
Commitment and Judicial Responsibilities?** 280
Sanford Levinson

- Catholic and Evangelical Supreme Court Justices: A Theological
Analysis** 296
Robert F. Cochran, Jr.

Private Conscience, Public Duties: The Unavoidable Conflicts Facing a Catholic Justice	312
Scott C. Idleman	
Factfinding as a Spiritual Discipline	325
Hon. Joan B. Gottschall	

UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS SCHOOL OF LAW
Minneapolis, Minnesota

THE UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS

Rev. Dennis Dease, President

Dr. Thomas Rochon, Executive Vice President, Chief Academic Officer

Dr. Mark Dienhart, Executive Vice President, Chief Administrative Officer

SCHOOL OF LAW FACULTY, 2006–2007

Thomas C. Berg

*B.S., M.A., M.A., J.D.,
Professor of Law*

Rene Bowser

*B.A., J.D., LL.M.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Elizabeth F. Brown

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,
Assistant Professor of Law*

Leah M. Christensen

*B.A., J.D.,
Assistant Professor of Law*

Teresa S. Collett

*B.A., J.D.,
Professor of Law*

Robert J. Delahunty

*B.A., M.A. Oxon., B.Phil., J.D.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Mitchell Gordon

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Neil W. Hamilton

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,
Professor of Law*

Mariana Hernandez-Crespo

*B.A., J.D., LL.M.,
Assistant Professor of Law*

Thomas E. Holloran

*B.S., J.D.,
Senior Distinguished Fellow
School of Law Professor Emeritus*

Nekima V. Levy-Pounds

*B.A., J.D.,
Assistant Professor of Law*

Susan E. McGuigan

B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law

Thomas M. Mengler

*B.A., J.D.,
Dean and Ryan Chair in Law*

Jerome M. Organ

*B.A., J.D.,
Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

Julie A. Oseid

B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Charles J. Reid, Jr.

*B.A., J.D., J.C.L., M.A., Ph.D.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Elizabeth R. Schiltz

*B.A., J.D.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Henry (Hank) J. Shea

*B.S.F.S., J.D.,
Senior Distinguished Fellow*

Gregory C. Sisk

*B.A., J.D.,
Professor of Law*

John F. Stinneford

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,
Visiting Professor of Law*

Morse H. Tan

*B.A., J.D.,
Visiting Professor of Law*

Scott A. Taylor

*B.S., M.A., J.D., LL.M.,
Professor of Law*

Robert K. Vischer

*B.A., J.D.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Rev. D. Reginald Whitt, O.P.

*B.A., S.T.B., J.D., J.C.L., J.C.D.,
Professor of Law*

Virgil O. Wiebe

*B.A., M.Phil., J.D., LL.M.,
Associate Professor of Law*

Jennifer L. Wright

*B.A., J.D.,
Associate Professor of Law*

UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS SCHOOL OF LAW
Minneapolis, Minnesota

SCHOOL OF LAW ADJUNCT FACULTY, 2006–2007

The Hon. Pamela G. Alexander, B.A., J.D. John Krenn, B.A., J.D.
The Hon. Ann L. Alton, B.A., J.D. The Hon. Robert J. Kressel, B.A., J.D.
David M. Bateson, B.A., J.D. Terri Krivosha, B.A., J.D.
Stephanie L. Beckman, B.A., J.D. Charles E. Lundberg, B.A., J.D.
Jonathon H. Bloomberg, B.S., J.D. Mary M. Lynch, B.A., J.D.
Monica M. Bogucki, B.S.W., J.D. Michael C. Mahoney, B.S., J.D.
Lisa M. Brabbit, B.A., J.D. Katherine A. McBride, B.A., J.D.
Robert T. Brabbit, B.A., J.D. Lawrence R. McDonough, B.A., J.D.
Roberta R. Brackman, B.A., J.D. Darryl L. Meyers, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Diane B. Bratvold, B.A., J.D. Kathleen A. Moccio, B.A., J.D.
The Hon. Kevin S. Burke, B.A., J.D. Mary F. Moriarty, B.A., J.D.
David E. Camarotto, B.A., J.D. Michael E. Murphy, B.A., M.A., J.D.
Uyen Campbell, B.A., J.D. Daniel M. Pauly, B.A., J.D.
The Hon. Lawrence D. Cohen, B.S.L., J.D. William B. Payne, B.S., J.D.
Paul J. Edlund, B.A., J.D. Ray Peterson, B.A., J.D.
Craig Fields, B.A., M.F.A. Jennifer A. Prestholdt, B.A., M.A.L.D., J.D.
The Hon. Kathleen R. Gearin, B.A., J.D. John W. Provo, B.A., J.D.
Thomas A. Gilligan, B.A., J.D. The Hon. Jay M. Quam, B.A., J.D.
Rick Goheen, B.A., J.D., M.S.L.S. Susan M. Robiner, B.A., J.D.
John B. Gordon, B.A., J.D. James W. Rockwell, B.A., J.D.
Peter D. Gray, B.A., J.D. Susan A. Roehrich, B.A., J.D.
Fr. Daniel F. Griffith, B.A., J.D., M.Div. The Hon. Kathleen Hvass Sanberg, B.A.,
William C. Griffith, B.A., J.D. J.D.
Bruce A. Grosland, B.A., M.A., J.D. Thomas Sieben, B.A., J.D.
Laura A. Hage, B.A., J.D. Michael Sonsteng, B.A., J.D.
William Hart, B.A., J.D. John H. Stout, B.A., J.D.
Robert J. Hauer, Jr., B.A., J.D. Robert Stuart, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Gene H. Hennig, B.S.M.E., J.D. Jake Sullivan, B.A., J.D., M.Phil.
Robert L. Hobbins, B.A., J.D. Scott G. Swanson, B.A., J.D.
Donald E. Horton, B.A., M.A., J.D. Peter Thompson, B.Mgt.E., J.D.
Kay Nord Hunt, B.A., J.D. Steven C. Tourek, B.A., M.A., LL.B., J.D.
Lee A. Hutton, III, B.A., J.D. The Hon. Edward Toussaint, Jr., B.A., J.D.
Jennifer Inz, B.A., J.D. Wright S. Walling, B.A., J.D.
Andrew N. Jacobson, B.Arch., J.D. David B. Washington, B.A., J.D.
Anita J. Jehl, B.A., J.D. Lisa P. Wheeler, B.A., J.D.
Thomas L. Johnson, J.D., LL.M. The Hon. Steven D. Wheeler, B.A., J.D.
Julie A. Jonas, B.A., J.D. Kenneth R. White, B.A., J.D.
Thomas Joyce, B.A., J.D. Martha K. Wivell, B.A., J.D.
Sean P. Kearney, BBA, J.D. Nancy Wolf, B.A., B.S., M.A., J.D.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

Send Order to:

University of St. Thomas Law Journal
1000 LaSalle Avenue
MSL 225
Minneapolis, MN 55403-2015

___ Current Subscription	___ Single past issue
\$ 50 – 3 issues (domestic)	\$20 per issue
\$100 – 3 issues (international)	Vol. ____, No. ____

Amount enclosed \$_____ (make checks payable to "University of St. Thomas")

Name _____

Address _____

City _____ State _____ Zip code _____

Orders may also be faxed to (651) 962-4915