

# UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS LAW JOURNAL

---

SUMMER 2006

VOLUME 4

NUMBER 1

---



Selected Papers from the  
Terrence J. Murphy Institute Conference  
Public Policy, Prudential Judgment, and  
the Catholic Social Tradition

Articles

Charles M. A. Clark  
R. Mary Hayden Lemmons  
Robert K. Vischer  
Andrew Yuengert

---

Comments

J. Wes Kiplinger  
Lucas McMillen  
Andrea Specht

*Fides et Iustitia*

---

**UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS**  
**LAW JOURNAL**  
*Fides et Iustitia*

---

SUMMER 2006

VOLUME 4

NUMBER 1

---

**Editor-in-Chief**

Christopher Nelson

**Articles Editors**

John Darda  
Jacob Thorington

**Managing Editor**

Gloria R. Sonnen

**Publications Editors**

Graham Martin  
Erika Toftness

**Symposium Editor**

Anna Petosky

**Comments Editor**

Christopher Duncan

**Membership Editor**

Alyssa Malecek Toft

---

**Senior Editors**

Jonathan Bakewicz  
Matthew C. Berger  
Joshua Brand  
Caroline Bussey  
Michael Cass  
Kenneth Connelly, Jr.  
Allison Frasier  
Kathleen Klos  
Lars Nelson  
Laura Santos  
Brooke Swenson

**Associate Editors**

Phil Ashfield  
John Bisanz  
Elizabeth Brenckman  
Erin Collins  
David Corbett  
Abigail Dos Santos  
Dave Dustrud  
Christian Eichenlaub  
Lisa Ellingson  
Breia Euteneuer

Nicole Frank  
Shannon Gherty  
Laura Hammargren  
Patrick Heaney  
Max Kieley  
Nathan Kumagai  
Andrea Pavelka  
Angela M. Streit  
Theodore Waldeck  
Jenny Weigel

**Faculty Advisor**

Professor Thomas C. Berg

**Administrative Assistant**

Jill Akervik

**Publication Information:** The *University of St. Thomas Law Journal* is published three times a year by law students at the University of St. Thomas School of Law in Minneapolis, Minnesota 55403-2015. It is printed by Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

**Mission:** The *University of St. Thomas Law Journal*, as a publication of a Catholic law school, is committed to encouraging ethical legal thinking through the publication of compelling legal scholarship dedicated to the discussion of morality and social justice, developing students' legal research and writing skills in an endeavor to produce accomplished servant leaders in the practice of law, and broadening the legal imagination to cultivate creative solutions to real world problems with a goal toward social change.

**Subscription Information:** Single issues are available for \$20.00. Subscriptions are \$50.00 per volume domestic, and \$100.00 per volume foreign. Unless the Journal receives notification of cancellation, subscriptions will be renewed annually.

Please send all change of address information, single issue and subscription inquiries, and cancellation notices to the address below.

**Submission Guidelines:** Unsolicited articles are considered for publication, but cannot be returned. All submissions should be double-spaced and conform to the *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation*. If selected for publication, all citations will be made to conform to the *The Bluebook*.

Please send all submissions to the address below. The Journal does accept submissions by e-mail.

**Citation information:** Please cite this issue as: 4 U. St. Thomas L.J. \_\_\_\_ (2006). All citation generally conforms to the *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation*, 18th ed.

**Copyright Information:** Unless otherwise noted, any material to which the University of St. Thomas Law Journal holds the copyright may be reproduced, in whole or in part, by non-profit institutions for educational purposes, provided that (1) copies are distributed at or below cost; (2) the author and the *University of St. Thomas Law Journal* are identified, including the volume number, the page on which the article starts, and the year of publication; (3) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy; and (4) notice of use is given to the University of St. Thomas Law Journal.

**Contact Information:**

University of St. Thomas Law Journal  
1000 LaSalle Avenue  
MSL 225  
Minneapolis, MN 55403

Telephone: (651) 962-4855 or (800) 328-6819, ext. 2-4855

Facsimile: (651) 962-4915

lawreview@stthomas.edu

<http://www.stthomas.edu/law/studentlife/journal/default.asp>

Copyright © 2007

University of St. Thomas Law Journal

All rights reserved except as specifically stated otherwise

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews

Printed in the United States of America

**UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS**  
**LAW JOURNAL**  
*Fides et Iustitia*

---

SUMMER 2006

VOLUME 4

NUMBER 1

---

**Selected Papers from the Terrence J. Murphy Institute Conference**  
**PUBLIC POLICY, PRUDENTIAL JUDGMENT AND**  
**THE CATHOLIC SOCIAL TRADITION**

**ARTICLES**

---

- Economic Justice and Welfare Reform: Was Welfare Reform an Example of Prudential Judgment in Public Policy? .....** 1  
Charles M. A. Clark
- Juridical Prudence and the Toleration of Evil: Aquinas and John Paul II .....** 24  
R. Mary Hayden Lemmons
- Professional Identity and the Contours of Prudence .....** 46  
Robert K. Vischer
- From Prophecy to Policy: Bishops, Prudence, and Immigration Politics .....** 66  
Andrew Yuengert

**COMMENTS**

---

- Defining Off-Campus Misconduct that "Impacts the Mission": A New Approach.....** 87  
J. Wes Kiplinger
- Eye on Islam: Judicial Scrutiny Along the Religious Profiling/Suspect Description Reliance Spectrum.....** 114  
Lucas McMillen
- The Government We Deserve? Direct Democracy, Outraged Majorities, and the Decline of Judicial Independence .....** 132  
Andrea Specht

**UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS SCHOOL OF LAW**  
*Minneapolis, Minnesota*

---

**THE UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS**

**Rev. Dennis Dease**, President  
**Dr. Thomas Rochon**, Executive Vice President, Chief Academic Officer  
**Dr. Mark Dienhart**, Executive Vice President, Chief Administrative Officer

**SCHOOL OF LAW FACULTY, 2006–2007**

**Thomas C. Berg**  
*B.S., M.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Professor of Law*

**Rene Bowser**  
*B.A., J.D., LL.M.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Elizabeth F. Brown**  
*B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Assistant Professor of Law*

**Leah M. Christensen**  
*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Teresa S. Collett**  
*B.A., J.D., Professor of Law*

**Robert J. Delahunty**  
*B.A., M.A. Oxon., B.Phil., J.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Mitchell Gordon**  
*B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Neil W. Hamilton**  
*B.A., M.A., J.D., Professor of Law*

**Mariana Hernandez-Crespo**  
*B.A., J.D., LL.M.,  
Assistant Professor of Law*

**Thomas E. Holloran**  
*B.S., J.D.,  
Senior Distinguished Fellow  
School of Law Professor Emeritus*

**Nekima V. Levy-Pounds**  
*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Susan E. McGuigan**  
*B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law*

**Thomas M. Mengler**  
*B.A., J.D.,  
Dean and Ryan Chair in Law*

**Jerome M. Organ**  
*B.A., J.D.,  
Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

**Julie A. Oseid**  
*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Charles J. Reid, Jr.**  
*B.A., J.D., J.C.L., M.A., Ph.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Elizabeth R. Schiltz**  
*B.A., J.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Henry (Hank) J. Shea**  
*B.S.F.S., J.D.,  
Senior Distinguished Fellow*

**Gregory C. Sisk**  
*B.A., J.D., Professor of Law*

**John F. Stinneford**  
*B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Visiting Professor of Law*

**Morse H. Tan**  
*B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law*

**Scott A. Taylor**  
*B.S., M.A., J.D., LL.M.,  
Professor of Law*

**Robert K. Vischer**  
*B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law*

**Rev. D. Reginald Whitt, O.P.**  
*B.A., S.T.B., J.D., J.C.L., J.C.D.,  
Professor of Law*

**Virgil O. Wiebe**  
*B.A., M.Phil., J.D., LL.M.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Jennifer L. Wright**  
*B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law*

**UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS SCHOOL OF LAW**  
*Minneapolis, Minnesota*

---

**SCHOOL OF LAW ADJUNCT FACULTY, 2006–2007**

The Hon. Pamela G. Alexander, B.A., J.D.    John Krenn, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Ann L. Alton, B.A., J.D.    The Hon. Robert J. Kressel, B.A., J.D.  
David M. Bateson, B.A., J.D.    Terri Krivosha, B.A., J.D.  
Stephanie L. Beckman, B.A., J.D.    Charles E. Lundberg, B.A., J.D.  
Jonathon H. Bloomberg, B.S., J.D.    Mary M. Lynch, B.A., J.D.  
Monica M. Bogucki, B.S.W., J.D.    Michael C. Mahoney, B.S., J.D.  
Lisa M. Brabbit, B.A., J.D.    Katherine A. McBride, B.A., J.D.  
Robert T. Brabbit, B.A., J.D.    Lawrence R. McDonough, B.A., J.D.  
Roberta R. Brackman, B.A., J.D.    Darryl L. Meyers, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
Diane B. Bratvold, B.A., J.D.    Kathleen A. Moccio, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Kevin S. Burke, B.A., J.D.    Mary F. Moriarty, B.A., J.D.  
David E. Camarotto, B.A., J.D.    Michael E. Murphy, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
Uyen Campbell, B.A., J.D.    Daniel M. Pauly, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Lawrence D. Cohen, B.S.L., J.D.    William B. Payne, B.S., J.D.  
Paul J. Edlund, B.A., J.D.    Ray Peterson, B.A., J.D.  
Craig Fields, B.A., M.F.A.    Jennifer A. Prestholdt, B.A., M.A.L.D., J.D.  
The Hon. Kathleen R. Gearin, B.A., J.D.    John W. Provo, B.A., J.D.  
Thomas A. Gilligan, B.A., J.D.    The Hon. Jay M. Quam, B.A., J.D.  
Rick Goheen, B.A., J.D., M.S.L.S.    Susan M. Robiner, B.A., J.D.  
John B. Gordon, B.A., J.D.    James W. Rockwell, B.A., J.D.  
Peter D. Gray, B.A., J.D.    Susan A. Roehrich, B.A., J.D.  
Fr. Daniel F. Griffith, B.A., J.D., M.Div.    The Hon. Kathleen Hvass Sanberg, B.A.,  
William C. Griffith, B.A., J.D.    J.D.  
Bruce A. Grosland, B.A., M.A., J.D.    Thomas Sieben, B.A., J.D.  
Laura A. Hage, B.A., J.D.    Michael Sonsteng, B.A., J.D.  
William Hart, B.A., J.D.    John H. Stout, B.A., J.D.  
Robert J. Hauer, Jr., B.A., J.D.    Robert Stuart, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
Gene H. Hennig, B.S.M.E., J.D.    Jake Sullivan, B.A., J.D., M.Phil.  
Robert L. Hobbins, B.A., J.D.    Scott G. Swanson, B.A., J.D.  
Donald E. Horton, B.A., M.A., J.D.    Peter Thompson, B.Mgt.E., J.D.  
Kay Nord Hunt, B.A., J.D.    Steven C. Tourek, B.A., M.A., LL.B., J.D.  
Lee A. Hutton, III, B.A., J.D.    The Hon. Edward Toussaint, Jr., B.A., J.D.  
Jennifer Inz, B.A., J.D.    Wright S. Walling, B.A., J.D.  
Andrew N. Jacobson, B.Arch., J.D.    David B. Washington, B.A., J.D.  
Anita J. Jehl, B.A., J.D.    Lisa P. Wheeler, B.A., J.D.  
Thomas L. Johnson, J.D., LL.M.    The Hon. Steven D. Wheeler, B.A., J.D.  
Julie A. Jonas, B.A., J.D.    Kenneth R. White, B.A., J.D.  
Thomas Joyce, B.A., J.D.    Martha K. Wivell, B.A., J.D.  
Sean P. Kearney, BBA, J.D.    Nancy Wolf, B.A., B.S., M.A., J.D.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

*Send Order to:*

University of St. Thomas Law Journal  
1000 LaSalle Avenue  
MSL 225  
Minneapolis, MN 55403-2015

___ Current Subscription	___ Single past issue
\$ 50 – 3 issues (domestic)	\$20 per issue
\$100 – 3 issues (international)	Vol. ____, No. ____

Amount enclosed \$\_\_\_\_\_ (make checks payable to "University of St. Thomas")

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip code \_\_\_\_\_

*Orders may also be faxed to (651) 962-4915*