

# UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS LAW JOURNAL

---

FALL 2005

VOLUME 3

NUMBER 2

---



## American Exceptionalism in the 21st Century

### Opening Addresses

Walter F. Mondale  
Robert Merry

### Keynote Address

Mark B. Rotenberg

### Articles

Claes G. Ryn  
Joseph Boyle  
William T. Cavanaugh  
Dr. Charles J. Reid, Jr.

Jack Goldsmith  
Philip Bobbitt  
John Harrison

---

### Comment

Justin C. Barnes

*Fides et Iustitia*

**UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS**  
**LAW JOURNAL**

*Fides et Iustitia*

---

FALL 2005

VOLUME 3

NUMBER 2

---

**Editor-in-Chief**

Beth Forsythe

**Managing Editor**

Justin Barnes

**Publication Editor**

Lucas McMillen

**Symposium Editor**

Kaarin Nelson

**Topics Editor**

Rachel Myers

**Articles Editor**

Andrea Specht

**Comments Editor**

Rhonda Gruber Skoby

**Senior Editors**

Ian Dobson

Chad Friesleben

Kristel Glorvigen

Elizabeth Drotning Hartwell

Anna Nelson

Kate Nilan

Kimberly Robinson

**Associate Editors**

Jonathan Bakewicz

Matt Berger

Joshua Brand

Caroline Bussey

Mike Cass

Kenneth Connelly, Jr.

John Darda

Christopher Duncan

Allison Frasier

Kathleen Klos

Alyssa Malecek Toft

Graham Martin

Christopher Nelson

Lars Nelson

Anna Petosky

Laura Santos

Gloria Sonnen

Brooke Swenson

Jacob Thorington

Erika Toftness

**Faculty Advisor**

Professor Thomas C. Berg

**Symposium Advisors**

Professors Charles Reid & Robert Delahunty

**Administrative Assistant**

Jill Akervik

**Publication Information:** The *University of St. Thomas Law Journal* is published semi-annually by law students at the University of St. Thomas School of Law in Minneapolis, Minnesota 55403-2015. It is printed by Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

**Mission:** The *University of St. Thomas Law Journal*, as a publication of a Catholic law school, is committed to encouraging ethical legal thinking through the publication of compelling legal scholarship dedicated to the discussion of morality and social justice, developing students' legal research and writing skills in an endeavor to produce accomplished servant leaders in the practice of law, and broadening the legal imagination to cultivate creative solutions to real world problems with a goal toward social change.

**Subscription Information:** Single issues are available for \$20.00. Subscriptions are \$50.00 per volume domestic, and \$100.00 per volume foreign. Unless the Journal receives notification of cancellation, subscriptions will be renewed annually.

Please send all change of address information, single issue and subscription inquiries, and cancellation notices to the address below.

**Submission Guidelines:** Unsolicited articles are considered for publication, but cannot be returned. All submissions should be double-spaced and conform to the *ALWD Citation Manual: A Professional System of Citation*. Alternatively, citations may follow *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation*. If selected for publication, all citations will be made to conform to the *ALWD Citation Manual*.

Please send all submissions to the address below. The Journal does accept submissions by e-mail.

**Citation information:** Please cite this issue as: 3 U. St. Thomas L.J. \_\_ (2005). All citation generally conforms to the *ALWD Citation Manual*, 2d ed.

**Copyright Information:** Unless otherwise noted, any material to which the University of St. Thomas Law Journal holds the copyright may be reproduced, in whole or in part, by non-profit institutions for educational purposes, provided that (1) copies are distributed at or below cost; (2) the author and the *University of St. Thomas Law Journal* are identified, including the volume number, the page on which the article starts, and the year of publication; (3) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy; and (4) notice of use is given to the University of St. Thomas Law Journal.

**Contact Information:**

University of St. Thomas Law Journal  
1000 LaSalle Avenue  
MSL 225  
Minneapolis, MN 55403

Telephone: (651) 962-4855 or (800) 328-6819, ext. 2-4855  
Facsimile: (651) 962-4915

lawreview@stthomas.edu

<http://www.stthomas.edu/law/studentlife/journal/default.asp>

Copyright © 2006

University of St. Thomas Law Journal

All rights reserved except as specifically stated otherwise

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews

Printed in the United States of America

**UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS**  
**LAW JOURNAL**  
*Fides et Iustitia*

FALL 2005

VOLUME 3

NUMBER 2

**AMERICAN EXCEPTIONALISM IN THE 21ST CENTURY**

**OPENING ADDRESSES**

- American Exceptionalism, Global Security, and Human Dignity: The Great Challenge of the 21st Century** ..... 169  
Walter F. Mondale
- American Exceptionalism: Avoiding the Hazards** ..... 175  
Robert Merry

**KEYNOTE ADDRESS**

- America's Ambiguous Exceptionalism** ..... 188  
Mark B. Rotenberg

**ARTICLES**

*Panel: The History, Religion, and Philosophy of American Exceptionalism*

- Unleashing the Will to Power: Neo-Jacobin Exceptionalism as a Justification for American Global Supremacy** ..... 211  
Claes G. Ryn
- The Catholic Teaching on War and Peace: Its Application to American Foreign Policy after 9/11** ..... 235  
Joseph Boyle
- Messianic Nation: A Christian Theological Critique of American Exceptionalism** ..... 261  
William T. Cavanaugh
- Edward Douglass White's Use of Roman and Canon Law: A Study in the Supreme Court's Use of Foreign Legal Citations** ..... 281  
Dr. Charles J. Reid, Jr.

*Panel: Human Rights and American Exceptionalism*

- The Unexceptional U.S. Human Rights RUDs** ..... 311  
Jack Goldsmith
- American Exceptionalism: The Exception Proves the Rule** ..... 328  
Philip Bobbitt

<b>Uniformity, Diversity, and the Process of Making Human Rights Norms</b> .....	334
John Harrison	

**COMMENT**

---

<b>Lessons from England’s “Great Guardian of Liberty”: A Comparative Study of English and American Civil Juries</b> .....	345
Justin C. Barnes	

UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS SCHOOL OF LAW  
*Minneapolis, Minnesota*

---

THE UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS

**Rev. Dennis Dease**, President

**Dr. Thomas Rochon**, Executive Vice President, Chief Academic Officer

**Dr. Mark Dienhart**, Executive Vice President, Chief Administrative Officer

SCHOOL OF LAW FACULTY, 2005–2006

**Thomas C. Berg**

*B.S., M.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Professor of Law*

**Julie A. Oseid**

*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Rene Bowser**

*B.A., J.D., LL.M.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Charles J. Reid**

*B.A., J.D., J.C.L., M.A., Ph.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Elizabeth F. Brown**

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Assistant Professor of Law*

**Elizabeth R. Schiltz**

*B.A., J.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Teresa S. Collett**

*B.A., J.D., Professor of Law*

**Patrick J. Schiltz**

*B.A., J.D., Professor of Law,  
St. Thomas More Chair in Law*

**Leah M. Christensen**

*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Gregory C. Sisk**

*B.A., J.D., Professor of Law*

**Robert J. Delahunty**

*B.A., M.A. Oxon., B.Phil., J.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**John F. Stinneford**

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Visiting Professor of Law*

**Edmund P. Edmonds**

*B.A., M.L.S., J.D., Professor of Law*

**Scott A. Taylor**

*B.S., M.A., J.D., LL.M.,  
Professor of Law*

**Mitchell Gordon**

*B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
Assistant Professor of Law*

**Robert K. Vischer**

*B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law*

**Neil W. Hamilton**

*B.A., M.A., J.D., Professor of Law*

**Ursula H. Weigold**

*B.J., B.A., J.D.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Nekima V. Levy-Pounds**

*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Rev. D. Reginald Whitt, O.P.**

*B.A., S.T.B., J.D., J.C.L., J.C.D.,  
Professor of Law*

**Daniel J. Libenson**

*B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law*

**Virgil O. Wiebe**

*B.A., M.Phil., J.D., LL.M.,  
Associate Professor of Law*

**Thomas M. Mengler**

*B.A., J.D.,  
Dean and Ryan Chair in Law*

**Jennifer L. Wright**

*B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law*

**Jerome M. Organ**

*B.A., J.D.,  
Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

# UNIVERSITY OF ST. THOMAS SCHOOL OF LAW

## *Minneapolis, Minnesota*

---

### SCHOOL OF LAW ADJUNCT FACULTY, 2005–2006

The Hon. Pamela G. Alexander, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Ann L. Alton, B.A., J.D.  
David M. Bateson, B.A., J.D.  
Jonathon H. Bloomberg, B.S., J.D.  
Monica M. Bogucki, B.S.W., J.D.  
Robert T. Brabbit, B.A., J.D.  
Lisa M. Brabbit, B.A., J.D.  
Roberta R. Brackman, B.A., J.D.  
Diane B. Bratvold, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Kevin S. Burke, B.A., J.D.  
Uyen Campbell, B.A., J.D.  
Leonardo Castro, B.A., J.D.  
Michael V. Ciresi, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Lawrence D. Cohen, B.S.L., J.D.  
Terrence J. Fleming, B.A., J.D.  
Thomas A. Gilligan, B.A., J.D.  
Rick Goheen, B.A., J.D., M.S.L.S.  
John B. Gordon, B.A., J.D.  
Peter D. Gray, B.A., J.D.  
Fr. Daniel F. Griffith, B.A., J.D., M.Div.  
William C. Griffith, B.A., J.D.  
Bruce A. Grosland, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
William Hart, B.A., J.D.  
Gene H. Hennig, B.S.M.E., J.D.  
Robert G. Hensley, B.A., J.D.  
Heidi M. Hoard, B.A., J.D.  
Robert L. Hobbins, B.A., J.D.  
Thomas E. Holloran, B.A., J.D.  
Donald E. Horton, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
Kay Nord Hunt, B.A., J.D.  
Lee A. Hutton, III, B.A., J.D.  
Andrew N. Jacobson, B.Arch., J.D.  
Scott W. Johnson, B.A., J.D.  
Thomas L. Johnson, J.D., LL.M.  
Julie A. Jonas, B.A., J.D.  
William A. Jonason, B.A., J.D.  
Sean P. Kearney, BBA, J.D.  
Denise M. Kettelberger, B.S., M.S., Ph.D.,  
J.D.  
Katherine M. Kowalchuk, B.S., Ph.D., J.D.  
John Krenn, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Robert J. Kressel, B.A., J.D.  
Terri Krivosha, B.A., J.D.  
Fr. Peter A. Laird, B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
M.Div., M.A.T., S.T.L.  
Michael A. Lindsay, B.A., J.D.  
Susan J. Link, B.A., J.D.  
Charles E. Lundberg, B.A., J.D.  
Katherine A. McBride, B.A., J.D.  
Lawrence R. McDonough, B.A., J.D.  
Darryl L. Meyers, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
William Mohrman, B.A., J.D.  
Mary F. Moriarty, B.A., J.D.  
Michael E. Murphy, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
Fay Nosow, B.A., M.Phil., J.D.  
Daniel M. Pauly, B.A., J.D.  
William B. Payne, B.S., J.D.  
The Hon. Bruce A. Peterson, B.A., J.D.  
Ray Peterson, B.A., J.D.  
Jennifer A. Prestholdt, B.A., M.A.L.D., J.D.  
John W. Provo, B.A., J.D.  
Susan M. Robiner, B.A., J.D.  
James W. Rockwell, B.A., J.D.  
Susan A. Roehrich, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Kathleen Hvass Sanberg, B.A.,  
J.D.  
Marguerite L. Spencer, B.A., A.M.R.S.,  
J.D.  
Leo G. Stern, B.A., J.D.  
John H. Stout, B.A., J.D.  
Robert Stuart, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
Scott G. Swanson, B.A., J.D.  
Peter Thompson, B.Mgt.E., J.D.  
Steven C. Tourek, B.A., M.A., LL.B., J.D.  
The Hon. Edward Toussaint, Jr., B.A., J.D.  
Mary R. Vasaly, B.A., J.D.  
Joanna L. Vossen, B.A., M.U.R.P., J.D.  
Roberta B. Walburn, B.A., J.D.  
Wright S. Walling, B.A., J.D.  
Lisa P. Wheeler, B.A., J.D.  
The Hon. Steven D. Wheeler, B.A., J.D.  
Kenneth R. White, B.A., J.D.  
Nancy Wolf, B.A., B.S., M.A., J.D.  
Salome Zusman, B.A., J.D.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

*Send Order to:*

University of St. Thomas Law Journal  
1000 LaSalle Avenue  
MSL 225  
Minneapolis, MN 55403-2015

\_\_\_ Current Subscription

\$ 50 – 3 issues (domestic)

\$100 – 3 issues (international)

\_\_\_ Single past issue

\$20 per issue

Vol. \_\_\_\_, No. \_\_\_\_

Amount enclosed \$\_\_\_\_\_ (make checks payable to "University of St. Thomas")

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip code \_\_\_\_\_

*Orders may also be faxed to (651) 962-4915*